

**Release detained doctors
and medical staff members,
and honor their martyrs**



Release detained doctors and medical staff members, and honor their martyrs

Introduction

Doctors stand as a strong bulwark against pandemics in any country, especially that we are living in the era of a virus that the world hasn't even developed a vaccine to help combat its spread.

Therefore, it has been necessary for medics and physicians to get support for the every effort they exert and the greatest risk they face with this life-threatening disease, and listening to the doctors' remarks and criticism is part and parcel of this support. However, this didn't happen. Since the coronavirus pandemic began, the state responded to the doctors facing its surge by incarcerating many of them, not for committing a crime but for merely criticizing the government's policy in handling the COVID-19 crisis, or for publishing their critical viewpoints which are deemed necessary and crucial as part of the preventive measures taken to control the spread of the disease.

Like it always does, the National Security Agency pressed against the doctors who had been arrested charges of: joining a terrorist group, misusing social media websites and spreading false news, which are considered unsubstantiated accusations that are based on no single legal evidence but rather on some investigative reports and statements that merely express the opinion of the officers conducting them, as asserted by Egypt's Court of Cassation.

Unfortunately, Doctors and healthcare workers who spoke out over COVID-19 state policies are facing such accusations from the Supreme State Security Prosecution and had been put in jail, in disregard of their needed efforts in society to combat the pandemic; especially that the Ministry of Health has designated new batches of medical college graduates to help control the spread of the coronavirus.

As such, this paper introduces the framework governing the relationship between state authorities- particularly the Public Prosecution- and doctors in Egypt and how this framework should have been followed in dealing with medical staff members.

First: Legal provisions and the Public Prosecutor's instructions that should be followed while treating doctors:

1- The Public Prosecutor's instructions to prosecuting bodies (procuratorates)

- Article (211) of the Public Prosecutor's instructions No. (20) of 1998:

"If a physician, dentist, or veterinarian from the Doctors Syndicate (the national association of medics) or other health workers unions is accused of committing a crime, the Prosecution must notify the competent syndicate head/chairman before starting the investigation, whether the crime is related to his profession or not whether the crime is related to his profession or not; so that the head of the Doctors Syndicate can attend himself, or send a union member on his behalf. And in case the crime committed requires urgent investigation proceedings, the investigating prosecutor must notify the Doctors Syndicate at the time he begins taking these measures. And in all cases, the chief of the governorate's Appeal Prosecution must be immediately notified of the incident."

2- Judicial Instructions to procuratorates

Article (596) of the Instructions:

"If a member of the professional syndicates is accused of a felony or misdemeanor related to his profession, the prosecution must notify the relevant unions about what has been attributed to him."

Article (597) of the Instructions

"The notification stipulated in the previous Article must include the name of the complainant/plaintiff, the number and the substance/merits of the case, and the legal provisions applied."

Article (598) of the Instructions

The aforementioned notification should be sent to the competent medical syndicate head in a timely manner, i.e. before the start of the investigation, so that he or whomever he delegates can attend the investigation in accordance with the law."

Article (599) of the Instructions

"The Prosecution must notify the relevant medical syndicate of the outcome of the investigation, in addition to all the judgments issued against its members by the criminal and misdemeanor courts to be kept abreast of the investigative process."

3- Article (54) of the Doctors Syndicate Law

"The Prosecution must notify the Doctors Syndicate of any accusation pressed against any of its members, whether it is a felony or misdemeanor, related to the medical profession before starting the investigation. The Syndicate's head/chairman or the head of sub-syndicates/unions (the doctors' union branch), or whomever he delegates from any of the syndicate's members or the subsidiary union's board members shall attend the investigation unless it is decided to conduct it in conditions of secrecy. And if the Prosecution considers that the accusation pressed against the syndicate's member does not warrant criminal prosecution, the union branch's board shall be notified of the investigation's results to decide on referring him to a disciplinary body. In the various litigation cases related to the medical profession, the accused doctor may request the intervention of his syndicate as a third party in any case presided over by the court in connection to whatever may concern the medical profession."

- Having said that, the Supreme State Security Prosecution did not follow the abovementioned instructions and legal provisions governing the investigation of medics. Rather, it based its indictment on the unsubstantiated statements included in the investigative reports conducted by the National Security officers. These reports don't entail any evidence or legal presumption of the validity of the accusations attributed to doctors, however, the Prosecution decided to put many of medics, healthcare workers, and assistant medical teams in jail, as outlined in the following lines.

Third: The detained doctors and assistant medical staff members:

(1) Dr. Mohamed Moutaz Mandour al-Fawal

Professor of Radiology at Faculty of Medicine, Zagazig University, and the Treasurer of the Doctors' Syndicate in Sharqiyah governorate

He was arrested from his home on the evening of June 25, 2020, and after two days, he appeared before the Supreme State Security Prosecution for investigation in connection with Case No. 558 of 2020, in which he faces charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media. Al-Fawal was interrogated after he commented on the Prime Minister's remarks accusing Egypt's doctors of "negligence" (1) as he took part in an online campaign launched on social media to reject the premier's statements. Al-Fawal was later released with precautionary measures.

(2) Dr. Ahmed Safwat

Member of the Doctors Syndicate's board, the Youth Committee

He was arrested on 28 June 2020 after voicing his response and criticism of the Prime Minister's remarks accusing medics in Egypt of "negligence and inaction" denouncing the government's treatment of medics and healthcare workers. Consequently, he was investigated by the Supreme State Security Prosecution on 30 June 2020 in connection with Case No. 535 of 2020 State Security on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media. The Prosecution then decided to hold him in remand detention pending investigations.

(3) Dr. Hany Bakr

An ophthalmologist at Toukh Hospital in Qalyubia governorate

The security forces arrested Dr. Hany Bakr, 36, from his private clinic, for a Facebook post in which he criticized the government sending medical aid and face masks to China and Italy when doctors at home were short of equipment. Consequently, he was investigated before the Supreme State Security Prosecution in Case No. 558 of 2020 on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media. The Prosecution then decided to hold him in remand detention pending probe.

(4) Dr. Alaa Shaaban Hamida Abdel-Latif

A gynecologist at El-Shatby Hospital in Alexandria

She was arrested from her workplace after she allowed a nurse to use her phone to report a case of coronavirus in the hospital, which led the hospital's director to report her to the authorities for what he called "bypassing her job limits". She had been kept in illegal detention for two days until she appeared at the Supreme State Security Prosecution's headquarters, where she was investigated in connection with Case No. 558 of 2020 on charges of "membership in a terrorist group", "spreading false news", and "misusing social media", and the Prosecution had ordered her remand detention before she was later released with precautionary measures.

(5) Pharmacist Mohamed Kamel Ghanem Mostafa al-Sayes

He was arrested on 4 April 2020 and had been illegally locked up for 5 days, after the National Security officers searched for the owner of the company where he works and his colleagues at the university, in addition to searching his phone. Al-Sayed was detained for sharing a post on his Facebook page in which he criticized the Minister of Health's performance in dealing with the coronavirus pandemic. Thereafter, he appeared before the State Security Prosecution which interrogated him in Case No. 558 of 2020 State Security on charges of "membership in a terrorist group", "spreading false news", and "misusing social media", before he was ordered to be held in remand detention pending investigations. (2)

(6) Dr. Mohamed Hamid Mahmoud

An Orthopedic doctor, Gamal Abdel Nasser Hospital

He was arrested from the house of his brother, who is accused in Case 535 of 2020 State Security Prosecution on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media. He is now being held in pretrial detention pending investigations.

(7) Dr. Ibrahim Abdel-Hamid Bediwi

Pediatric surgeon, Mataria Educational Hospital

He is accused in Case 535 of 2020 State Security Prosecution, over which he is being held in pretrial detention pending investigations on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media.

(8) Dr. Ahmed Sabra Ahmed Ibrahim

Professor of Gynecology and Obstetrics at Banha Universtiy

He is accused in Case 558 of 2020 State Security Prosecution, over which he is being held in pretrial detention pending investigations on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media.

(9) Dr. Mohamed Mahmoud Tayeb

An Orthopedic doctor, Gamal Abdel Nasser Hospital

He is accused in Case 535 of 2020 State Security Prosecution on charges of joining an outlawed group, spreading false news and misusing social media. He is now being held in pretrial detention pending investigations.

* Although these doctors are being held in remand detention and some of them had already been released, they were incarcerated without legal evidence that prove the accusations pressed against them. But the Ministry of Health, which is concerned with protecting the rights of these doctors, did nothing to protect or defend them although it should have been at the forefront of state institutions to adopt their views; since doctors and medics spearhead those who build a buffer against the crisis the country is facing.

Fourth: Coronavirus martyrs of duty...Doctors and medical professionals who died of COVID-19

Egypt's Doctors Syndicate and sub-syndicates announced that there are more than 200 martyred doctors and medical personnel, who died after coronavirus infection and as a result of their efforts to combat the disease, noting that the real number of deaths could be higher than the official one due to the fact that many victims and martyrs couldn't be able to undertake the PCR tests. The official figure represents only those who are confirmed they had tested positive for COVID-19 and died on duty, but there are other medics who were martyred for the same reason but hadn't been reported for not undertaking the PCR testing.

The Arabic Network for Human Rights Information has been able to list the names of 196 martyrs from doctors and assistant medical staff members. They are:

- 1- Dr. Ahmed Al-Lawah, Professor of Medical Analysis at Al-Azhar University
- 2- Dr. Ashraf Adly, a Cardiology Consultant at Qena General Hospital
- 3- Dr. Tareq Shukry, Consultant Psychiatric, Neurological and Addiction Treatment, and the former deputy head of Abbasiya Hospital
- 4- Dr. Mahmoud Mahmoud Al-Hindawi, Professor of Neurosurgery, Faculty of Medicine, Al-Azhar University for Girls, and former Director of Al-Zahra University Hospital
- 5- Dr. Mamdouh Al-Sayed, Former Director of the Ambulance Facility in Sohag governorate
- 6- Prof. Dr. Hisham Al Saket, Vice Dean of the Faculty of Medicine at Qasr Al-Ainy University for Community Services and Environmental Development
- 7- Dr. Fikri Mounir Aziz, Emergency Specialist, St. Mark Hospital, Cairo
- 8- Dr. Amr Ebeid, Professor of Nephrology, Faculty of Medicine, Alexandria University
- 9- Dr. Ahmed Al-Nani, a Gynecologist and Obstetrician in Banha's Health Insurance Hospital
- 10- Dr. Mohamed Abdel-Basit Al-Jabri, a Dietitian in Imbaba Hospital
- 11- Dr. Walid Yahya Abdel Halim, a Gynecologist at Al Munira Hospital
- 12- Dr. Hassan Gamal El Din Farhat, Professor of Ophthalmology at Menoufia University's Faculty of Medicine
- 13- Dr. Yasser Othman, a consultant of chest diseases, at Al Mamoura Chest Hospital
- 14- Dr. Karim Mahmoud, Head of the Internal Medicine Department at Luxor International Hospital
- 15- Dr. Ahmed Ezzat Deraz, Deputy Director of Minya Al-Qamh Health Center
- 16- Dr. Salah Abd Rabbo, Professor of Pediatrics, Faculty of Medicine, Al-Azhar University, Damietta
- 17- Dr. Abd al-Latif Abd al-Hamid, Director of the Health Administration at Hehyia Center, Sharqya governorate
- 18- Dr. Ahmed Mahmoud Abu Sadiq, Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT) Consultant/ Otolaryngologist
- 19- Dr. Mohamed Hashad, a Pediatrician at Nasser General Hospital
- 20- Dr. Salah El-Shimi, Professor of Dermatology, Ain Shams University
- 21- Dr. Raafat Nagy, Obstetrician and Gynecologist Consultant, Giza
- 22- Dr. Abdel-Latif Dabour, an Urologist at Senbellawein center
- 23- Dr. Ahmed Yassin Ghallab, an Urologist in Damanhour governorate
- 24- Dr. Samir El-Ghandour, Professor of Orthopedic, Faculty of Medicine, Suez Canal University
- 25- Dr. Gamal Abu Al-Ela, former Internal Medicine Consultant and former Head of Internal Medicine departments at Al Monira General Hospital
- 26- Dr. Ronz Yassa Maqar, a Gynecologist and Obstetrician, Beni Suef
- 27- Dr. Ashraf Al-Qadi, Consultant of Internal Medicine and Dietetics, Aswan
- 28- Dr. Albert Gerges, a Pediatrician, Abu Tig, Assiut

- 29- Dr. Mohamed Farid El-Gendy, Head of Department of Cardiac Surgery at the National Heart Institute
- 30- Dr. Mahmoud El-Sayed Abdel-Halim El-Ghazlany, a consultant in Cairo Fevers Hospital
- 31- Dr. Yahya Saad, Director of the Eye (El-Ayoun) Hospital for Children in Cairo
- 32- Dr. Mutasim Mahmoud Zaki, a surgeon at Mataryia Educational Hospital
- 33- Dr. Hany Refaat, Professor of Nephrology, Ain Shams University
- 34- Dr. Abdel-Azim Abu Al-Hassan, a Consultant Urologist at Menouf General Hospital
- 35- Dr. Mohamed Abdel-Hafez, a Specialist in Internal Medicine at Zefta General Hospital, Gharbia Governorate
- 36- Dr. Mohamed Antar, Professor of Pharmaceutical Medicine, Azhar University, Damietta
- 37- Dr. Nermin Jalal, Obstetrician and Gynecologist Consultant, Cairo
- 38- Dr. Ibrahim Ali, Professor of Clinical Pathology, Azhar Medical College (for boys)
- 39- Dr. Mohsen Al-Hitami, Professor of Internal Medicine Al-Azhar
- 40- Dr. Hisham Abdel-Hamid, Pediatric Specialist, Helwan
- 41- Dr. Sayed Rushdi Mahjoub, Professor of Neurosurgery, Al-Azhar University's Faculty of Medicine
- 42- Dr. Samir Othman, Consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Helwan
- 43- Dr. Ayman Zaki, Consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Helwan
- 44- Dr. Mahmoud Khader, a Surgeon, Cairo
- 45- Dr. Philip Metri, an otolaryngologist
- 46- Dr. Youhanna Lotfi Sadiq, Obstetrician and Gynecologist Consultant in Qalyubia hospitals, died in intensive care at El-Demerdash Hospital.
- 47- Dr. Ali Howaidi, former director of Sherbin Fever Hospital
- 48- Dr. Mohamed Abdel Hakim, Consultant of Internal Medicine, Helwan
- 49- Dr. Mohamed Hassan Omar, Internist and Fevers Consultant, Luxor
- 50- Dr. Nabil Khalifa, Professor of Orthopedics, Ain Shams University
- 51- Dr. Ezzat Fahmy Salib, Anesthesia consultant, Banha Hospital
- 52- Dr. Fayek Fakhry, former director of Luxor Health Office
- 53- Dr. Sayed Nadi Kamel, a Dietitian in Minya
- 54- Dr. (George Attia Habib) is a Consultant Pediatrician in Cairo, and director of the Specialist Medical Center in Zeitoun, Cairo
- 55- Dr. (Mohamed Hassan Ahmed), former director of Luxor Fever Hospital
- 56- Dr. (Hamza Ibrahim Tarkhan), Analyst Specialist
- 57- Prof. Dr. (Salem Khalil) Professor of Urology in Zagazig
- 58- Dr. (Raafat Muhammad Al-Qadi), a Consultant surgeon in Aswan
- 59- Dr. (Yousry Kamel), Deputy Director of the Heart Institute
- 60- Dr. (Mohamed Abdel-Alim Saad), Professor of Anatomy at Tanta University
- 61- Dr. (Adel Abdel Azim Shebel), Former consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology at Al Mounira Hospital
- 62- Dr. (Nabil Naseem), Consultant of Heart and Intensive Care, at 6th of October Hospital
- 63- Dr. (Amira Munir), Professor of Ophthalmology, Faculty of Medicine, Ain Shams University
- 64- Dr. (Mohamed Abdel-Alim), Professor of Anatomy, Faculty of Medicine, Tanta University
- 65- Prof. Dr. Adel Fouad Ramzy, Professor of Surgery, Al-Qasr Al-Aini
- 66- Dr. (Iman Ibrahim), a physician at Atwab Health Unit affiliated to Al-Wasti Administration in Beni Suef
- 67- Dr. (Emile Fawzy), Specialist Surgery at Ibshaway Hospital, Fayoum
- 68- Dr. (Ali Hassan Al-Arabi), Liver Consultant Hospital at Al-Sahel Hospital

- 69- Dr. (Ahmad Al-Zaftawi), Senior Consultant, Al-Mansoura Chest Hospital
- 70- Dr. (Ahmed Fathy Muhammad Awad), Consultant of Ophthalmology in Luxor
- 71- Dr. (Abdel-Hamid Abu Youssef), Fever Consultant, Mahmoudyia Hospital
- 72- Dr. (Sayed Hathout) Professor of Urology, Al-Azhar University
- 73- Dr. (Michael Wagih), member of Assiut Doctors' Syndicate
- 74- Dr. (Rami Karim El-Deeb), an artificial kidney specialist at Qaranshu Kidney Unit, died in Kafr El-Zayat General Hospital for Quarantine
- 75- Dr. (Hisham Abdel Qader Mukhtar Youssef), a physician at Al-Wasti Hospital, Bani Suef
- 76- Dr. (Hassan Mahmoud Fadel), Consultant of General Surgery in Sohag
- 77- Dr. (Emad Habib), Consultant of Internal Medicine, Maghaghah Hospital, Minya
- 78- Dr. (Jamal Sabry) Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT) Consultant/ Otolaryngologist Al-Tal Al-Kabeer
- 79- Dr. (Tariq Ashour), a Pediatrician, Alexandria
- 80- Dr. Mustafa Zaitoun, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Zagazig
- 81- Dr. (Muhammad Abu State) Professor of Surgery, Al-Azhar University
- 82- Dr. (Hisham Saeed) Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT) Consultant/ Otolaryngologist, Om Al-Masryeen Hospital
- 83- Dr. (Magdy Nashi Masih), Consultant of Internal Medicine in Cairo
- 84- Dr. (Mohamed Abdel Hafez), Internal Medicine Specialist, Zefta General Hospital
- 85- Dr. (Mahmoud Madani Khalil), Former consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Beni Suef
- 86- Dr. (Ishaq Sergius) Specialist in Internal Medicine, Qena General Hospital
- 87- Dr. (Mohamed Ahmed El-Ghalyouni), Assistant Lecturer of Gastroenterology and Tropical Medicine, Assiut University
- 88- Dr. (Nabila Abdel-Hamid Abdel-Hafez)
- 89- Dr. (Omar Abdel-Rafea), Internal Medicine Consultant, Former Head of Internal Medicine departments at Om Al-Masryeen Hospital
- 90- Dr. (Walid Yahya), a physician in Mounira General Hospital
- 91- Dr. (Ezzat Fahmy Salib), Anesthesia Consultant, Qalyubia
- 92- Dr. Abd Al-Hamid Abu Youssef, Internal Medicine Consultant, Mahmoudia
- 93- Dr. Ishaq Awad Attieh, Digestive Diseases Consultant, Aswan
- 94 - 30 June 2020- Dr. Kamal Abdel Nabi Saleh, General surgery Consultant and Chief surgeon in Beni Suef
- 95 - 30 June 2020- Dr. Ibrahim Musa Hassan Al-Muradani, Specialist in Psychiatry and Addiction Treatment at Al Mamoura Psychiatric Hospital
- 96 - 1 July 2020- Prof. Dr. Mustafa Ali Al-Sayed, Consultant in Cardiovascular diseases and Interventional Catheterization, Former Professor and Head of the Cardiovascular Department, Al-Azhar University
- 97 - 3 July 2020 -Dr. (Ayman Zaki Ahmed), a Gynecology and Obstetrics specialist, passed away in Al-Nasr Quarantine Hospital in Helwan
- 98-4 July 2020- Dr. Mahmoud El-Batal, a Gynecology and Obstetrics consultant at Maghagha Hospital, died at the quarantine hospital in Malawi, , Minya
- 99-4 July 2020- Dr. (Esmat Abdel Majid Bahnasi Shaalan), Director General of the Police Cadets Institute Hospital, who died in the quarantine hospital in Ashmoun, Menoufia
- 100 - 7 July 2020-Dr. (Mohamed Sami Barghout), Assistant Professor of Pediatrics at Tanta University, passed away in the Psychiatric Hospital's Intensive Care
- 101- 7 July 2020 Dr. (Abdel-Gawad Al-Sayed Saad), Professor at the Liver Institute in Menoufia, where he passed away while in quarantine

102 - 4 July 2020- Major General Dr. (Jalal Sayed Ahmed Muhammad Ghazanfar), an ENT consultant at Maadi Military Hospital, died in the Intensive Care of Almaza Military Hospital

103 - 9 July 2020- Dr. Mahmoud Mohamed Ahmed El-Fouly, a retired professor in the Department of Pharmacology, Faculty of Medicine, Banha University, passed away while in quarantine at the Liver Institute

104 - 11 July 2020- Dr. Raymond Imad Faragallah, Assistant Professor at the Department of Internal Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Fayoum University, who died in the Intensive Care at the French Kasr Al-Aini Hospital

105 - 12 July 2020- Dr. Arafa Rajab Omar Nahle, Former director of Al-Takamol Hospital Shouni, Gharbia, died while in quarantine at a hospital in Kafr El-Zayat

106 - 13 July 2020 Dr. (Hossam Ahmed Helmy), a Consultant Pediatrician in Alexandria, died in the Al-Agamy Quarantine Hospital

107 - 13 July 2020 Prof. Dr. Ayman El-Desouki, Professor of Internal Medicine, Gastroenterology and Hepatology at Faculty of Medicine, Mansoura University, died in the Quarantine Hospital at Mansoura University

108 - 13 July 2020 Dr. (Salwa Farhat) Fever Consultant and Head of the Quarantine Department at Al-Matareya Hospital in Dakahlia

109 - 13 July 2020 Dr. (Mohamed Yousry), consultant of internal diseases and the former director of the Health Insurance Hospital in Beni Suef, passed away in the Quarantine Hospital in Beni Suef

110 - 13 July 2020 Dr. Mustafa Mohamed Elfeki, consultant surgery at Mahmoudia Hospital in Beheira, passed away at the Medical Center in Alexandria

111 - July 14, 2020 Dr. (Samir Mohamed Madani), former director of Health Insurance at Helwan University

112 - 14 July 2020 Dr. (Hani Naeem Sedrak), a surgeon at Sohag General Hospital

113 - 15 July 2020 Dr. (Yasser Al-Sharqawi), A specialist at Mahalla Heart Center's Intensive Care

114 - 15 July 2020 Dr. (Ahmed Abdel Rahman Imam), Othopedic consultant at Beni Suef General Hospital, died while in quarantine at the University Hospital in Beni Suef

115 - 15 July 2020 Dr. (Abdullah Muhammad Muhammad Ismail), an Internal Medicine specialist at Al-Ahrar Hospital in Sharqia, died while in quarantine at the hospital

116 - 15 July 2020 Dr. (Muhammad Rajab Sarhan), a Fever consultant at Hosh Issa Central Hospital, passed away in Kafr El Dawar quarantine hospital

117 - 15 July 2020 Dr. (Bahaa El-Din Ahmed Ali), an ophthalmology consultant at the Ophthalmology Hospital in Qena, passed away at the quarantine hospital in Esna

118 - 16 July 2020 Dr. (Atef Mahmoud Salem), a Consultant of General Surgery and Infection Control

119 - 16 July 2020 Dr. (Mohamed Azazi Mahmoud), Internal Medicine Specialist, Department of Hepatology, Gastroenterology and Endoscopy at Al-Ahrar Teaching Hospital, died while in quarantine at the University Hospital in Zagazig

120 - 16 July 2020 Dr. (Youssef Sayed Ahmed), a Pediatric consultant at Sahel Selim Hospital in Assiut, died while in quarantine at Al-Rajhi Hospital

121 - 16 July 2020 Dr. (Wissam Sayed Deeb Sayed), Assistant Professor of Obstetrics and Gynecology in Fayoum, She died of Coronavirus infection in Al-Qasr Al-Aini intensive care, after she was put on the ICMO device for about a month

122 - 19 July 2020 Dr. Abdul Nabi Abdul Sattar Al-Batran, General Surgery Consultant, General Director of the Radio and Television Union

123 - 20 July 2020 Dr. (Wagih Mhanna, said by Grace), a consultant obstetrician and gynecologist in Alexandria, died at the quarantine hospital in Agamy, Alexandria

124 - 22 July 2020 Dr. Omar Al-Awamri, a consultant internist and dieter, and the former deputy director of the Alexandria Fever Hospital, died in Al-Agamy Quarantine Hospital in Alexandria

125 - 22 July 2020 Dr. Wardani Hassan Eid, a Consultant surgeon and former director of Al-Adwa Hospital

126 - 22 July 2020 Dr. (Adel Gerges), a Consultant in chest diseases and director of Chest Kafr al-Dawwar Clinic

127 - 22 July 2020 Dr. (Ali Mahmoud Saif), a consultant surgeon at Damsna Hospital in Abu Homs, Al Buhaira, passed away in Itay Al Baroud Quarantine Hospital in Al Beheira governorate.

128 - 23 July 2020 Dr. Heba Madi, Specialist in Obstetrics and Gynecology at the Women's Hospital and Reproductive Health, Marsa Matrouh

129 - 25 July 2020 Dr. Muhammad Eid, Consultant surgeon in Dakahlia Governorate, died in intensive care at Mansoura Chest Hospital

130 - 25 July 2020 Dr. (Mohamed Metwally Hilal), Former director of Shebin El-Kom Teaching Hospital

131 - 27 July 2020 Dr. (Maher Mahmoud Abdel Halim Fourth), a consultant Nephrologist, died in the October 6 Hospital for Health Insurance in Dokki

132 - 29 July 2020 Dr. (Ayman Abdel Mawgoud), Consultant General and Laparoscopic Surgery and Head of the General Surgery Department at Rashid General Hospital

133-29 July 2020 Prof. Dr. Osama Amin El-Barmawy, Professor of Otolaryngology, Faculty of Medicine, Tanta University

134 - 2 August 2020- Dr. Muhammad Nadir Tutu, a specialist in chest diseases at Mamoura Chest Hospital in Alexandria, died in Al-Agamy Quarantine Hospital

135 - 4 August 2020 Dr. (Abdel Wahab Al Saadani) Head of the Pediatrics Department at Mansoura International Hospital, passed away in Mansoura Chest Hospital

136 - 4 August 2020, Dr. (Magdy Amin El Demiri), Consultant Urologist at El Mahalla General Hospital

137-4 August 2020 Dr. (Nabil Turki Morsi Abu Zahra), a retired general surgery doctor and former director of Shoubrahit Central Hospital in Beheira Governorate, passed away in Alexandria International Hospital in Smouha

138 - 4 August 2020 Dr. Gamal Soliman Tawfiq Selim, Consultant of Internal Medicine and Cardiology, Marsa Matrouh

139 - 4 August 2020 Dr. (Ali Al-Morsi Abdel Razek), a consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology at Al-Manzala Hospital, died in the Tami Al-Amdid Quarantine Hospital in Dakahlia

140-5 August 2020 Dr. Alaa Abdel-Karim Abdel-Majeed, a consultant orthopedic surgeon at Dairout Central Hospital, passed away in Al-Iman General Quarantine Hospital, Assiut

141 - 6 August 2020 Prof. Dr. (Abdel Moneim Kamel Rabie), Professor and former Head of the Chest Department, Faculty of Medicine, Alexandria, passed away while in quarantine at Alexandria University Students Hospital

142- 6 August 2020 Dr. (Ahmed Abdel Aziz Ahmed Hassanein), a specialist in pediatrics at Qalyoub Specialist Hospital, died in the hospital's intensive care department

143- 10 August 2020 Dr. Gamal Hussein Mazen, a Pediatrics and Newborn Consultant in Sohag, where he died in the Heart and Digestive Institute Quarantine Hospital

144 - 10 August 2020 Dr. Rabih Al-Najjar, Pediatrician at Kafr El-Zayat Hospital

145 - 11 August 2020 Dr. (Ahmed Mahmoud Kamel), a consultant Obstetrician and Gynecologist in Alexandria

146 - 14 August 2020, Dr. (Esmat Abdel Khaleq Al-Mirghani), a specialist in obstetrics and gynecology, passed away at Al-Agamy Quarantine Hospital in Alexandria

147 - 15 August 2020 Dr. Ahmad Madi, specialist in chest diseases in Al Mamoura Hospital
148 - 16 August 2020 Dr. Jamil Atallah, consultant pediatrician at Mit Ghamr Hospital
149 - 18 August 2020 Dr. (Abdul Aziz Bonduq), an Internal Medicine Consultant at Health Insurance Hospital in Dakahlia, passed away in Mansoura Chest Hospital
150 - 20 August 2020 Dr. (Hisham Ali Ghoneim), Consultant of Internal Medicine and Nephrology and the former Director of Ahmed Maher Hospital in Alexandria, passed away in Al-Gomhoria Hospital
151 - 22 August 2020 Dr. (Wael Ali Shoukry), a nephrologist
152 - 22 August 2020 Dr. Dina Qutb is a resident physician, obstetrics and gynecology, at Mahalla General Hospital
153 - 24 August 2020 Dr. Maher El-Sayed Ramadan Jazar, Professor of Anesthesiology and Intensive Care, Faculty of Medicine, Alexandria University, passed away in the University's Students Hospital
154 - 27 August 2020 Dr. (Sameh Kamal Youssef Morsi) Assistant Professor of Physiology at Al-Azhar Medicine, Assiut Branch
155 - 27 August 2020 Dr. Ibrahim Hashem Abdel Rahman Hashish, Consultant of Surgery and Director of the Al-Dhahriya Unit, Itay Al-Baroud Center, passed away in Kafr El-Dawar Isolation Hospital
156- 29 August 2020, Dr. (Wagnat Tawfiq), consultant cardiologist, Mansoura Specialist Hospital
157 - 29 August 2020 Dr. Ibrahim Shaban, a specialist in Internal Medicine and Nephrology in Beni Suef, died in Bush Quarantine Hospital
158 - 30 August 2020 Dr. (Nadia Fahmy El-Hadary), consultant of Internal Medicine, Mabara Al-Asafra Hospital, died in Tosson Hospital for Quarantine
159 - 31 August 2020 Dr. (Ayman Hussain Nasif) Consultant Internal Medicine at Aja Hospital
160 - 1 September 2020 Dr. (Mai Amr Mohamed), Consultant cardiologist (free doctor), who passed away at Obour Specialist Hospital
161 - 5 September 2020 Dr. Muhammad Hasan Issa, Cardiologist
162 - 8 September 2020 Dr. (Mustafa Al-Sayed Abdo), Specialist in Cardiology and Vascular Diseases at the Heart Center in Mahalla Al-Kobra
163 - 9 September 2020 Dr. (Tariq Abdel Aziz) Lecturer of Anesthesiology, Mansoura Medicine
164 - 13 September 2020 Dr. (Mukhtar Mukhtar Musa Samon), a consultant of chest diseases in Dilngat in Buhaira Governorate
165 - 14 September 2020 Dr. (Alaa Ahmed Al-Tayeb), a consultant and head of the Orthopedic Department at Kafr El-Zayat Hospital
166 - 15 September 2020 Dr. (El Sayed Abdel Moamen Fares) is a Fever consultant in Alexandria
167 - 15 September 2020 Dr. (Jamal Abdel Aleem El-Deeb), a consultant and former director of Damietta Fever Hospital, where he died
168 - 15 September 2020 Dr. (Nabil Gad Al-Haq) Professor of Surgery at Faculty of Medicine, Mansoura University, he passed away in the university's hospital
169- 19 September 2020, Dr. (Mohamed Diab), a consultant fever in Sharkia, who passed away in isolation from the university hospital
170- 19 September 2020, Dr. (Diaa Al-Atfi), Director of the Basion Fever Hospital
171- 19 September 2020- Dr. (Leila El-Sayed Ziada), Professor of Hematology at the Medical Research Institute in Alexandria, she passed away in the Students Hospital in Alexandria
172 - 24 September 2020 Dr. (Megawer Fathy Al-Dafrawi), a pediatrician at Hosh Issa Hospital in Beheira, he passed away at Chest Damanhour Hospital

173 - 24 September 2020 Doctor (Muhammad Nabih), a consultant anesthesiologist in Dakahlia, died in Tammy Al-Amdid quarantine hospital

174 - 26 September 2020 Dr. (Ahdi Al-Hamamsi), Intensive Care Consultant at Zarqa Central Hospital

175 - 26 September 2020 Dr. Ibrahim Hanafi Abdel Moneim, Head of the Nephrology Department at Abu Al Matamir Hospital, passed away inside Al-Ajami Quarantine Hospital

176 - 26 September 2020 Dr. (Atia Pasha) is a consultant nephrologist at Damanhour Teaching Hospital

177 - 27 September 2020 Dr. (Hassan Abdel Latif Youssef), consultant obstetrician and gynecologist in Alexandria

178- 29 September 2020 Dr. (Jamila Zaki Muhammad Al-Saadani) Consultant of Obstetrics and Sciatica at Al-Manshawi General Hospital

179 - 30 September 2020 Dr. (Jamal Abdel Tawab Muhammad Abu Bakr), a consultant Internist and former director of the Tahrir General Hospital in Imbaba, he died in the Quarantine Hospital in Agouza

180 - 30 September 2020 Dr. (Azza Muhammad Mahmoud Ghunaim), Obstetrics and Gynecology Consultant and Director of the Medical Commission, Students Hospital at the Medical Administration, Menoufia University, passed away at the Private Durra Hospital in Shebin al-Kom, Menoufia Governorate

181 - 30 September 2020 Dr. (Mr. Abdel Latif Nasr), former director of the Shubrahour Hospital in Dakahlia, died in the Quarantine Hospital of Mansoura

182 - 1 October 2020 Dr. Mohamed Al-Saeed, an emergency specialist at Dikirnis Hospital, Dakahlia

183 - October 10, 2020 Dr. (Hussein Abd Al-Latif Abdul Wahid Hussein), former director of Shalashmon Central Hospital, Sharqya

184 - 13 October 2020 Dr. (Ayman Muhammad Ramadan), Radiologist at Sinbillawain Hospital

185 - 13 October 2020 Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim Mahmoud Al-Asaily, Head of the Internal Medicine Department at Al-Senbellawein Hospital, died in Mansoura Chest Hospital

186 - 13 October 2020 Dr. Amr Abdel Azim Mohamed Mahmoud, a chest diseases consultant, died in Qasr Al-Aini Hospital

187 - 14 October 2020 Dr. (Majed Zakry Jaid Gerges), cardiovascular consultant, died in Aswan Chest Hospital

188- 18 October 2020 Dr. (Jamal Wafiq Abbas), former consultant of Obstetrics and Gynecology at Mansoura General Hospital

189 - 24 October 2020 Dr. (Ahmed Mahmoud Bassiouni), a consultant pediatrician in the Health Insurance Hospital in Alexandria, died in Al-Agamy Quarantine Hospital

190 - 26 October 2020 Dr. Zakaria Mohamed Abd Rabbo Ismail, former Undersecretary of the Ministry of Health in Qalyubia, died in Chest Diseases Hospital in Damanhour

191 - 1 November 2020 Dr. (Hassan Fathy Hassan Al-Maqash), a pensioned consultant pediatrician, died in Gamal Abdel Nasser Hospital

192- 3 November 2020 Prof. Dr. (Tariq El-Gamal), former Deputy Director of Mansoura University Hospital

193 - 3 November 2020 Dr. (Hani Yahya Abdel Qader Shalabi), an anesthesiologist at Badr Central Hospital in Beheira, passed away in Al-Ajami Central Hospital for Quarantine

194 - 3 November 2020 Dr. Salama Louis Ghali, a specialist in chest and tuberculosis diseases, passed away at Abbasiya Chest Hospital.

195 - 11 November 2020 Dr. (Saad Eddin Najeeb Saad Eddin Al-Sharif) Consultant Internal Medicine.

196 - 11 November 2020- Dr. Mohamed Abu El-Maati Abdel Aziz, Assistant Professor, Department of Pathology, Faculty of Medicine, Menoufia University

Conclusion

All of the above-mentioned bring us to the question: How can a profession whose practitioners have given all these martyrs be a threat to the country's national security? How can we claim this without taking into consideration the fact that these doctors represent the most important shield to confront the pandemic?!

Also, how can we ask those who are afraid of voicing their viewpoints regarding public health issues to take the initiative and spare no effort to combat the pandemic while they themselves are subject to arrest because of their opinions?

Recommendations

- 1- The Public Prosecutor must promptly release all the doctors arrested for expressing their opinion on how the state should be managing the coronavirus crisis, which they are integral part of.
- 2- Tightening instructions to the Public Prosecution's members to highlight the need to respect the Public Prosecutor's directives on treating doctors and those of similar status.
- 3- The Egyptian government should re-examine the health file in accordance with what is proposed by the Constitution along with the World Health Organization's recommendations.
- 4- The Egyptian Ministry of Health should launch a serious and constructive dialogue with the Doctors Syndicate and Egyptian medics on how to handle the coronavirus crisis, especially after the outbreak of the pandemic's second wave.

=====

(Footnotes)

(1) A statement by Cairo's Doctors Syndicate issued on 25 June 2020, website accessed on: 7 October 2020

<https://www.facebook.com/%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B5%D9%81%D8%AD%D8%A9-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B1%D8%B3%D9%85%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D9%84%D9%86%D9%82%D8%A7%D8%A8%D8%A9-%D8%A3%D8%B7%D8%A8%D8%A7%D8%A1-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%82%D8%A7%D9%87%D8%B1%D8%A9-290743114281769/photos/pcb.3181105098578875/3181100738579311>

(2) Darb website, news article published on 11 July 2020, accessed on: 7 October 2020

<https://daarb.com/%D9%88%D9%82%D8%B9-%D8%AD%D9%85%D9%84%D8%A9-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%82%D9%8A%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%AA-%D9%84%D9%84%D9%85%D8%B7%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A8%D8%A9-%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A5%D9%81%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AC-%D8%B9%D9%86/>